IN THE UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

In re:	2014 SEP 25 P u: 0)	Chapter 9
CITY of DETROIT, MICHIGAN	U.S. Swins - 10 (600) F. S. Krish - 10 (600)	Case No. 13-53846
cirror bernori, whemoan)	Hon. Steven W. Rhodes
Debtor.)	

RESPONSE OF MELYNI RICHARDSON TO DEBTOR'S SIXTH OMNIBUS OBJECTION TO CERTAIN CLAIMS

NOW COMES MELYNI RICHARDSON, through her attorneys at The Lobb Law Firm, and for her Response to Debtor's Sixth Omnibus Objection to Certain Claims (Docket No. 7198), states as follows:

- 1. On August 29, 2014, the Debtor filed its Sixth Omnibus Objection to Certain Claims. Therein, the Debtor argued that this Court should disallow the claims of numerous creditors, including Melyni Richardson.
- 2. The sole ground cited in the Objection is that the claims referenced therein, including Ms. Richardson's claim, were not filed prior to the February 21, 2014 General Bar Date.
- 3. Ms. Richardson filed her Proof of Claim by sending it via United States Postal Service First Class Mail to the City of Detroit Claims Processing Center in El Segundo, California, on February 17, 2014. (See Exhibit A Letter and Copy of Proof of Claim).
- 4. Ms. Richardson's claim was received by the Claims Processing Center and assigned Claim Number 3586.
- 5. The United States Supreme Court has held that mailing alone does not constitute filing, but that filing requires delivery and receipt by the proper party. *United States v. Lombardo*,

- 241 U.S. 73, 36 S. Ct. 508, 60 L.Ed. 897 (1916). However, a timely and accurate mailing does raise a rebuttable presumption that the mailed material was received, and thereby filed. *Hagner v. United States*, 285 U.S. 427, 430, 52 S.Ct. 417, 76 L.Ed. 861 (1932); *Haag v. Commissioner*, 59 F.2d 516, 517 (7th Cir. 1932).
- 6. As set forth above, Ms. Richardson's Proof of Claim was sent by United States Postal Service First Class Mail to the City of Detroit Claims Processing in El Segundo, California, on February 17, 2014, allowing a reasonable amount of time for timely arrival before the General Bar Date of February 21, 2014.
- 7. Furthermore, Bankruptcy Rule 3003, which governs the filing of a Proof of Claim in this case, grants this Court discretion to allow Ms. Richardson's claim, even if it was not timely filed.
- 8. Rule 3003(c)(3) permits this Court to extend the time within which Proofs of Claim or interest may be filed, which may be sought and granted before or after the General Bar Date.
- 9. Likewise, this Court has broad equitable powers to balance the interests of parties. *NLRB v. Bildisco & Bildisco*, 465 U.S. 513 (1984). "Equitable determinations are within the sound discretion of the bankruptcy judge . . ." *In re M.J. Waterman & Associates, Inc.*, 27 F.3d 604, 607 (6th Cir. 2000).
- 10. As stated by the *Waterman* court, this Court should be careful not to "enact too heavy-handed a measure to punish a creditor who may have not have strictly adhered to the formalities of the filing requirements, but whose actions were sufficient to put the court and the debtor on notice of his or her intention to seek to hold the debtor liable." *Id.*

- 11. This Court has recognized that when determining equities, it is proper to consider whether the existence of a claim was apparent to both parties. See *In re Norman R. Hugues*, Case No. 06-14172 (E.D. Mich. 2006).
- 12. Indeed, bankruptcy courts have extended service periods, and noted that time limits may be extended under Rule 9006(b), under an excusable neglect standard. See e.g., *In re Sheehan*, 253 F.3d 607 (9th Cir. 2001).
- 13. Moreover, Rule 5 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, which applies in Adversary Proceedings pursuant to Bankruptcy Rule 7005, provides that service is complete upon mailing.
- 14. Considering the foregoing, the Debtor's Objection as to Ms. Richardson's claim should be overruled.
- 15. Ms. Richardson's Proof of Claim was sent by First Class Mail, as allowed per court order within a reasonable time to arrive prior to the General Bar Date.
- 16. Additionally, the Debtor had ample notice of Ms. Richardson's intent to hold it liable, as her underlying lawsuit was filed on April 4, 2013.
- 17. In light of the foregoing, the interests of equity demand that Ms. Richardson's claim be allowed.

WHEREFORE, MELYNI RICHARDSON respectfully requests that the Court overrule Debtor's Objection as to her claim, Claim No. 3586, and that her claim be deemed allowed as a general unsecured claim.

Respectfully submitted,

THE LOBB LAW FIRM

JOSEPH R. LOBB (P26009) 26321 Woodward Avenue Huntington Woods, MI 48070 (248) 591-4090 (248) 591-4089 (fax)

Dated: September 19, 2014

EXHIBITA

Postage	8		
Centiled Fee		Posinst	
etelun, řescelpt file (Endorsement Required)		Here	
Prestricted Delivery Fee /Endorsement Required)		1.11.	
Total Postage & Fees	\$	1246	
Sen To City	7.75.75.75 T	N. W. Y.	
Street Apt. 146.; or PO Sex No.	335 NACK	- Area	
TOTAL STATES	SE W.	CH 40:245	ļ

]]]

במחם מחבם

オポロシ

LOBB

26321 Woodward Avenue Huntington Woods, MI 48070 Phone: (248) 591-4090

Fax: (248) 591-4089
TOLL FREE: (855)-LOBB-911

Thelobblawfirm.com

Mail/Return Receipt Requested*** February 17, 2014

chy of Denon Claims Processing Cente c/o Kurtzman Carson Consultants, LLC 2335 Alaska Avenue El Segundo, CA 90245

Re: Proof of Claims

Dear Sir or Madam:

In regard to the above referenced matter, please find enclosed one original and one copy of Chapter 9 Proof of Claims in the following matters:

	Name of Creditor	Our File No.
1.	Sean Derrick Andrews	7700-3
2.	Renee Andrews	7699-3
3.	Tanora Adams	6873
4.	Yvonne Coleman	7500-1
5.	Clear Imaging (Terrance Martin)	6919
6.	Wendy Readous	6407-1
7.	Carlita Buffington	6088-3
8.	Gina Parker	7115-3
9.	Melyni Richardson	7018-1
10.	Bridgett Scott	5850-3
11.	Clear Imaging (Lashan Bell)	6595

Please return a time-stamped copy acknowledging receipt of this filing in the enclosed self-addressed, postage prepaid return envelope.

Thank you for your time and attention to this matter.

Sincerely, THE LOBB LAW FIRM

Daniel A. Groves

Daniel A. Groves

DAG/tll Enclosures B10 (Official Form 10) (04/13) (Modified)

D)((01.25tt 1 01tt 10) (1 15) (1 15)		
UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT EASTERN	DISTRICT of MICHIGAN	CHAPTER 9 PROOF OF CLAIM!)
Name of Debtor: City of Detroit, Michigan	Case Number: 13-53846	20世紀及先生10月至北京
NOTE: Do not use this form to make a claim for an administrative expense the		FEB 2 5 2014
Name of Creditor (the person or other entity to whom the debtor owes money or		tates to be the
Richardson, Melyni		COURT USE ONLY WITH THE
Name and address where notices should be sent: NameID: 11702788		Check this box if this claim amends a
Richardson, Melyni		previously filed claim.
Cherie Lobb		Court Claim Number:
26321 Woodward Ave. Huntington Woods, MI 48070		(If known)
		Filed on:
Name and address where payment should be sent (if different from above):		Check this box if you are aware that
SAME AS ABOVE		anyone else has filed a proof of claim relating to this claim. Attach copy of
0,400	e	statement giving particulars.
		0 (-)
Telephone number: email:		
1. Amount of Claim as of Date Case Filed: \$ 55, 6	00.	Secretary South
If all or part of the claim is secured, complete item 4.		THE STATE OF AMERICAN SERVICE AND ADDRESS OF THE STATE OF
If all or part of the claim is entitled to priority, complete item 5.	Try mean	
Check this box if the claim includes interest or other charges in addition to the	principal amount of the claim. Attach a	statement that itemizes interest or charges.
2. Basis for Claim: MT. NO-PAULT ING	2 BENGTIS	
(See instruction #2)		***************************************
3. Last four digits of any number by which creditor identifies debtor:	(See instruction #3a)	int as:
4. Secured Claim (See instruction #4)		other charges, as of the time case was filed,
Check the appropriate box if the claim is secured by a lien on property or a right setoff, attach required redacted documents, and provide the requested informatio		, n any: \$
Nature of property or right of setoff: DReal Estate DMotor Vehicle DOI:	ner Basis for perfection:	
	A A . C C A . Clair.	
Value of Property: \$	Amount of Secured Claims	55
Annual Interest Rate (when case was filed)% ☐Fixed or ☐ Variable	e Amount Unsecured:	\$ <u> </u>
5. Amount of Claim Entitled to Priority as an Administrative Expense und	er 11 U.S.C. §§ 503(b)(9) and 507(a)(2)	. \$
5b. Amount of Claim Otherwise Entitled to Priority. Specify Applicable Sc	ection of 11 U.S.C. §	\$
6. Credits. The amount of all payments on this claim has been credited for the	purpose of making this proof of claim. (S	ee instruction #6)
7. Documents: Attached are redacted copies of any documents that support the	claim, such as promissory notes, purcha	se orders, invoices, itemized statements of
running accounts, contracts, judgments, mortgages, security agreements, or, in the statement providing the information required by FRBP 3001(c)(3)(A). If the claim	he case of a claim based on an open-end o	or revolving consumer credit agreement, a
evidence of perfection of a security interest are attached. (See instruction #7, and	d the definition of "redacted".) DO NOT	SEND ORIGINAL DOCUMENTS.
ATTACHED DOCUMENTS MAY BE DESTROYED AFTER SCANNING.	•	
If the documents are not available, please explain:		
8. Signature: (See instruction # 8) Check the appropriate box.		
\ . · · ·	Amorton and the Julianian and Year .	narantor, surety, indorser, or other codebtor.
or their		uptcy Rule 3005.)
I declare under panalty of perjury that the information provided in this claim is	• •	gge, information, and reasonable belief.
Print Name: NELIN RICHARDEON	~ 1/01 -N /	his loss and
Title:	N WILMAN ICH	10/00/00/1 2-14-1
Address and telephone number (if different from notice address above):	(Signature)	(Date)
SAME AS ABOUT	V	
1090		÷
11111 2011 1111 111		